

Adopted on May 1, 2023.

**LANDMARK PRESERVATION COMMISSION
APRIL 17, 2023 MEETING MINUTES**

Members Present:

Jack Coladarci, Chairman
Chris Enck
Laura Good
Beth Ann Papoutsis

Non-Voting Member Absent:

Bob Dearborn

Members Absent:

Joseph Stuart
Paul Weaver

Village Staff:

David Schoon, Director of Community Development
Christopher Marx, Associate Planner

Call to Order & Roll Call:

Chairman Coladarci called the meeting to order at 7:23 p.m. Mr. Marx took roll call of the Commission Members present.

Public Comment

No public comment was made at this time.

Approval of March 26, 2023 Meeting Minutes:

Chairman Coladarci asked if there were any comments or corrections to be made to the March 26, 2023 minutes. Ms. Good referred to line nos. 31 and 50 on page 2 and clarified several comments as well as the mention that the Commission Members would like to tour 1205 Sunset Road. Chairman Coladarci asked for a motion to approve the March 26, 2023 minutes, as amended. A motion to approve the March 26, 2023 meeting minutes, as amended, was made by Mr. Enck and seconded by Ms. Good. A vote was taken and the motion unanimously passed, 4 to 0:

AYES: Coladarci, Enck, Good, Papoutsis

NAYS: None

Demolition Permit Applications:

a. Case No. 23-05-LPC - 1205 Sunset Road: (continued from March 6, 2023 meeting): Review of the demolition permit application submitted for the single-family residence at 1205 Sunset Road.

Mr. Marx stated the application was previously reviewed by the Commission with the desire to learn more about one of the architects and the architect's biography as well as to obtain additional interior and exterior photos. He stated the Community Development Department accumulated the additional information requested relating to the architect, Cynthia Weese, and additional photos of the home. Mr. Marx stated no additional information to what the Historical Society had provided was found relating to the original firm which designed the home in 1955. The additional information is included in the packet as Attachments A and B. He then asked if there were any questions.

Ms. Good questioned whether the new photos of the interior of the home provided were part of the original packet. Mr. Marx stated they were not part of the original packet. Ms. Papoutsis asked if the fixtures and hardware from the home would be salvaged or if deconstruction was discussed. Mr. Marx responded that is outside of the Community Development Department's purview. Village President Chris Rintz responded the Village would consider limited deconstruction although a complete dismantlement of the home would not be able to be done. Ms. Papoutsis suggested the Historical Society may have suggestions as to taking any salvageable items.

Ms. Good questioned the process of how the project unfolded in terms of the demolition timeline and why the Commission was not approached beforehand. President Rintz explained how the owner came to the Village relating to the stormwater construction process in connection with a necessary easement from the property

owner on their property. He explained the process relating to MWRD programs which were offered in terms of the grant obtained to purchase and demolish the home for stormwater purposes. Ms. Good commented on Cynthia Weese's history and significance and the home's significance. President Rintz then asked the Commission to review the Vineyard Preservation Trust of Martha's Vineyard and how it can be crafted to fit Winnetka in terms of preservation. Chairman Coladarci asked if there were any other questions. No additional questions were raised at this time.

Chairman Coladarci then asked for public comment. No comments were made at this time. He then asked for a motion to approve the demolition permit for 1205 Sunset Road. Ms. Papoutsis asked if the additional information obtained would be filed with the Historical Society. Mr. Schoon confirmed that is correct noting additional photos would be taken once the occupants left the home. Mr. Enck reiterated that salvable items should be obtained from the home prior to demolition. Chairman Coladarci stated a tour of the home can be planned as an agenda item for a future meeting.

A motion to grant the demolition permit for 1205 Sunset Road was made by Mr. Enck. The motion was seconded by Ms. Papoutsis. A vote was taken and the motion unanimously passed, 4 to 0:

AYES: Coladarci, Enck, Good, Papoutsis

NAYS: None

Historical Architectural Impact Studies (HAIS):

a. Case No. 23-01-LPC - 13 Indian Hill Road: Review of the Historical Architectural Impact Study (HAIS) submitted for the single-family residence at 13 Indian Hill Road.

Mr. Marx stated at the January 2023 meeting, the Commission voted to require an HAIS for 13 Indian Hill Road and the HAIS included as Attachment A was provided by the applicant with the Historical Society agreeing with the findings made which are included as Attachment B. He then asked if there were any questions. No questions were raised at this time.

Chairman Coladarci asked if there were any questions for the applicant. Ms. Papoutsis asked Mike Ciaglia, the applicant, if he considered other plans for the home which has architectural significance. Mr. Ciaglia responded it was always contemplated the home would be demolished with the land returning to open space. He noted they salvaged items from the home for reuse. Mr. Enck asked Mr. Ciaglia if he considered deconstruction. Mr. Ciaglia responded he did not and he is not familiar with the process. Mr. Enck stated the Village can provide information to Mr. Ciaglia to consider. No additional questions were raised at this time.

Chairman Coladarci commented the HAIS is well prepared and thorough. Ms. Good asked Susan Benjamin how many Otis and Clark homes have been demolished. Mr. Marx stated due to late change of the scheduling of the April meeting, Jean Guarino was unable to make the meeting due to a schedule conflict. He also noted that the Historical Society has done very comprehensive research of Otis and Clark homes and may have that information.

Chairman Coladarci asked for a motion to state the Commission found the HAIS to be complete. Ms. Good moved to find the HAIS complete. Mr. Enck seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion unanimously passed, 4 to 0:

AYES: Coladarci, Enck, Good, Papoutsis

NAYS: None

Chairman Coladarci asked if there were any public comments. No comments were made at this time. Chairman Coladarci then asked the Commission Members if they felt a demolition delay would be appropriate. Ms. Good noted Ms. Guarino stated the home has state and local architectural significance. Chairman Coladarci referred to the fact the applicant may be willing to consider deconstruction. Ms. Good stated that has never impacted the Commission's decision in terms of demolition. Chairman Coladarci stated he would not be in favor of delaying the demolition. Ms. Good referred to the amount of Otis and Clark homes and other historic homes the Village has lost.

1 Mr. Ciaglia stated he has done everything asked of him including properly documenting the home and delaying
2 demolition would not yield any other result with the new home adding to the architectural significance of the
3 community. Mr. Enck referred to several aspects of the home and asked if they considered repurposing the prior
4 building as a guest home for example. Mr. Ciaglia responded he would not keep the second home just to keep it.
5 Chairman Coladarci suggested the Commission's power to delay demolition would be more appropriate in the
6 instance of a builder tearing the home down as opposed to the applicant who would be using it as open space. Mr.
7 Enck encouraged Mr. Ciaglia to consider deconstruction. Mr. Ciaglia stated as much as the items in the home that
8 can be repurposed has been done. Ms. Good reiterated her position and stated she would not be in favor of the
9 request. No additional comments were made at this time.

10
11 Chairman Coladarci called the matter in for discussion and read the findings into the record relating to the HAIS
12 being complete and stated the Commission found the HAIS complete. He then asked for a motion. Ms. Good
13 moved to delay the demolition permit for 13 Indian Hill Road. The Commission Members discussed their positions
14 at length. Ms. Papoutsis seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion was tied, 2 to 2:

15 AYES: Good, Papoutsis

16 NAYS: Coladarci, Enck

17
18 Chairman Coladarci then asked for a motion to approve the demolition of 13 Indian Hill Road to proceed without
19 delay. A motion to approve the demolition without delay was made by Mr. Enck. The Commission Members and
20 applicant further discussed their positions. Chairman Coladarci seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the
21 motion was tied, 2 to 2:

22 AYES: Coladarci, Enck

23 NAYS: Good, Papoutsis

24
25 The Commission Members discussed whether the delay period can be shortened to less than 270 days or allow
26 deconstruction to proceed during the delay period. Mr. Schoon explained there are no new homes planned for the
27 lot and referred to the Hibbard Road deconstruction project. Mr. Enck explained how the deconstruction approach
28 during the delay period is the best option in terms of salvaging parts of the home. Mr. Schoon stated that scenario
29 is not addressed in the ordinance. The Commission Members and Mr. Schoon also discussed the precedent of
30 shortening the delay period to less than 270 days. Mr. Schoon stated the Commission needed to be prepared to
31 explain why this particular application qualified for less than a 270 day delay which would be challenging to do. Ms.
32 Good added it would open the Village up to lawsuits from previous applicants.

33
34 The Commission Members discussed conditions on a demolition application approval to include deconstruction.
35 Chairman Coladarci then stated the matter would continue to the next meeting date when more Commission
36 Members may be present. He then asked for a motion to continue the matter to the May 1, 2023, meeting. Ms.
37 Good moved to continue the application to the May 1, 2023, meeting. Ms. Papoutsis seconded the motion. A vote
38 was taken and the motion unanimously passed, 4 to 0:

39 AYES: Coladarci, Enck Good, Papoutsis

40 NAYS: None

41
42 **b. Case No. 22-26-LPC - 614 Pine Lane: Review of the Historical Architectural Impact Study (HAIS)**
43 **submitted for the single-family residence at 614 Pine Lane.**

44 Gwen Sommers Yant and Susan Benjamin of Benjamin Historic Certifications presented the HAIS to the
45 Commission. Ms. Sommers Yant referred to the PowerPoint presentation and described the significant changes
46 made to the home. Her presentation identified the property's location, surrounding estate properties and
47 subdivision characteristics, the property owners and how the property changed over time. Ms. Benjamin stated a
48 fire at the home substantially damaged the home which she commented was a stunning example of French
49 architecture. Ms. Sommers Yant and Ms. Benjamin then referred to the home's privacy aspects and described the
50 home's massing, scale, mansard roof, landscaping plan and several of the home's other characteristics as well as
51 information on the home's architects.
52

Ms. Sommers Yant stated in terms of neighborhood impact, the home has limited visibility from the street or neighboring properties while describing the neighboring homes' orientation and relationships. She stated in terms of historical significance, she referred to the significant owners and stated the home suffered from a devastating loss of historical significance and integrity and cannot be deemed architecturally or historically significant, as well as the significant changes done to the home over time. Ms. Sommers Yant concluded the neighborhood impact of the home's demolition would not be negative.

Chairman Coladarci asked if there were any questions. No questions were raised at this time. Mr. Marx referred to the Village staff's points noting the Commission determined that an HAIS was required and the Historical Society agreed with the assessment that the home is architecturally and historically significant with the alternate damaged structure no longer having architectural or historical significance. He also noted there were four comments from the public included as Attachment H and asked if there were any questions. No questions were raised at this time.

Chairman Coladarci asked for public comment. No comments were made at this time.

Chairman Coladarci then asked for a motion to determine the HAIS is complete. A motion to find the HAIS for 614 Pine Lane is complete was made by Mr. Enck and seconded by Ms. Papoutsis. A vote was taken and the motion unanimously passed, 4 to 0:

AYES: Coladarci, Enck, Good, Papoutsis

NAYS: None

Chairman Coladarci then asked the Commission Members if the demolition should be approved without delay and read the findings into the record. He then asked for a motion to approve the demolition for 614 Pine Lane without delay. A motion to approve the demolition for 614 Pine Lane without delay was made by Ms. Papoutsis and seconded by Mr. Enck. A vote was taken and the motion unanimously passed, 4 to 0:

AYES: Coladarci, Enck, Good, Papoutsis

NAYS: None

Other Business:

a. May 1, 2023 Meeting – Quorum Check.

Mr. Marx noted there were no demolition applications or HAIS reports to be presented at the May 2023 meeting with the 13 Indian Hill Road matter being continued to this meeting date. The Commission Members discussed their availability. Chairman Coladarci asked if the name change discussion would be held at the May 2023 meeting. Mr. Marx responded he did not know if Trustee Dearborn would be attending.

b. 2023 Preservation Awards Update.

Mr. Marx informed the Commission that the deadline is the end of May and asked the Commission Members for any submissions. He confirmed no nominations have been received so far.

Adjournment:

Chairman Coladarci asked for a motion to adjourn. A motion to adjourn was made by Ms. Papoutsis and seconded by Mr. Enck. A vote was taken and the motion unanimously passed, 4 to 0:

AYES: Coladarci, Enck, Good, Papoutsis

NAYS: None

The meeting adjourned at 9:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Antionette Johnson

Recording Secretary