

Adopted on August 5, 2024

**LANDMARK PRESERVATION COMMISSION
JUNE 17, 2024, SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES**

Members Present:

Jack Coladarci, Chairman
Chris Enck
Laura Good
Joseph Stuart
Paul Weaver

Members Absent:

Beth Ann Papoutsis

Non-Voting Members Present:

Kim Handler

Junior Commissioner Present:

Louis Zaranski

Village Staff:

David Schoon, Director of Community Development
Christopher Marx, Associate Planner

Call to Order & Roll Call:

Chairman Coladarci called the meeting to order at 7:08 p.m.

Public Comment

No public comment was made at this time. Mr. Marx confirmed no additional written correspondence was received.

Historical Architectural Impact Studies (HAIS):

a. Case No. 23-21-LPC - 445 Sheridan Road: Review of the Historic and Architectural Impact Study (HAIS) attached to the demolition permit for the single-family residence at 445 Sheridan Road.

Mr. Marx provided a summary of the HAIS report status submitted for 445 Sheridan Road. He stated an amended and updated HAIS was provided by the applicant and referred to Addendums A and B in the document. Mr. Marx then advised the Commission Members of their role in terms of an official decision and asked if there were any questions. No questions were raised at this time.

Erica Ruggiero of McGuire Igleski & Associates, Inc. introduced herself to the Commission. She then provided a summary presentation of the HAIS to the Commission including a history of the prior owners, house renovations, architects, and landscaping. Ms. Ruggiero also explained the history and differences of the Spanish Revival style and Mission Revival Style which are attributed to the home's characteristics. She then described the home's exterior changes which she commented did not detract from the home's exterior. Ms. Ruggiero stated in response to the request in connection with the stained-glass windows, she indicated they could not find any information from the original artist.

Ms. Ruggiero then described in detail the home's interior renovations. She commented that the well-preserved character-defining features of the home's exterior and interior are the physical representations of the home's historical and architectural significance. Ms. Ruggiero then referred to the home's interior photos and exterior photos of the coach house whose original designer is unknown and which was substantially altered. She also referred to their evaluation in that the home is significant in connection with its association with several noteworthy owners and its expression as western U.S regional architecture and its migration from California to Illinois in the early 20th century whose Mission Revival architectural style is an invaluable and significant piece of Winnetka's architectural legacy.

Ms. Ruggiero then described the impact of how the loss of the architectural and historical property would impact the neighborhood and the results of the survey taken of the immediate residences. She then asked if there were any additional questions.

1
2 Ms. Good asked Ms. Ruggiero if they had knowledge of any other Mission Revival style homes in the Chicagoland
3 area. Ms. Ruggiero responded there were a few smaller examples in the suburban areas. She explained their
4 conclusion with regard to the Spanish Revival style description which style did not occur until 1915 and which is
5 why the home was identified as Mission Revival as the home was constructed prior 1915. Chairman Coladarci
6 asked Ms. Ruggiero if she had access to the home at the time the report was written and questioned its interior
7 condition. Ms. Ruggiero confirmed that is correct and referred to the water leak and described the interior
8 condition as good as opposed to fair or poor. Mr. Enck referred to their review of historic estates on the east side
9 of Sheridan Road. Ms. Ruggiero responded they focused on the 30 homes on the east side from the 1900 to 1930
10 time period with 12 homes remaining. She also explained how they were able to gather information from several
11 different sources on those homes. Chairman Coladarci asked Ms. Ruggiero if she felt the home should be saved.
12 Ms. Ruggiero responded that all architecturally or historically significant homes are not meant to be saved and
13 indicated it would be nice if the property could be saved, and if not saved the home's materials salvaged or
14 preserved.

15
16 Mr. Stuart asked Ms. Ruggiero if they had ever come across a similarly historic home. Ms. Ruggiero responded
17 while they have not seen such a Mission Revival style home of this size and substance in Illinois, she described the
18 home as unique to the Midwest and Illinois and described the home as unique and significant. Mr. Stuart stated
19 the Commission has reviewed many significant homes which are in significant disrepair.

20
21 Ms. Good noted for the record that while the home is not a designated landmark or on the National Register of
22 Historic Places, the home is worthy of both designations and none of the former owners applied for those statuses.
23 Ms. Ruggiero provided the Commission with information on other Mediterranean Revival style homes in
24 surrounding areas which she described as an uncommon style. She noted the report focused on the home being
25 Mission Revival with a few aspects of Craftsman style. No additional questions were raised at this time.

26
27 Chairman Coladarci asked for public comment. No comments were made at this time.

28
29 Vijay Kotte, the property owner and applicant, offered to answer questions and thanked the Commission Members
30 for considering the request at the special meeting. Chairman Coladarci then called the matter in for discussion.

31
32 Chairman Coladarci asked for a motion to find the HAIS complete. A motion to find the HAIS for 445 Sheridan Road
33 as complete was made by Mr. Enck and seconded by Mr. Weaver. A vote was taken and the motion unanimously
34 passed, 5 to 0:

35 AYES: Coladarci, Enck, Good, Stuart, Weaver

36 NAYS: None

37 NON-VOTING: Handler, Zaranski

38
39 Mr. Marx referred to the standards on page 4 to be cited in the Commission's vote as well as for the Commission
40 to provide items of historic or architectural significance to this specific property and also to identify any
41 alternatives to demolition.

42
43 Chairman Coladarci asked for a motion to issue the demolition permit for 445 Sheridan Road without delay. No
44 motion was made.

45
46 Chairman Coladarci then referred to the five demolition standards which the Commission discussed in detail.
47 Chairman Coladarci then referred to the following: that the Commission finds that the Historical Architectural
48 Impact Study (HAIS) for 445 Sheridan Road prepared by McGuire Igleski & Associates, Inc. is complete and that the
49 building or structure is considered to be historically or architecturally significant as it meets one or more of the
50 following standards: (i) the structure exhibits a high quality of architectural design without regard to the time built
51 or historic associations; (ii) the structure exhibits a high quality of architectural design that is not the result of a
52 change or a series of changes in the original structure; (iii) the structure exemplifies an architectural style,
53 construction technique or building type once common in the Village; (iv) the structure exhibits an unusual,

1 distinctive or eccentric design or construction technique that contributes to the architectural interest of its
2 environs as an accent or counterpart; or (v) that the property has been designated a landmark pursuant to Chapter
3 15.64 of the Village Code, has been included in the most recent Illinois Historic Structure Survey conducted under
4 the auspices of the Illinois Department of Conservation, or has been listed on the National Register of Historic
5 Places or the Illinois Register of Historic Places.

6
7 Trustee Handler referred to the wording on page 8 relating to retaining sufficient integrity as well as it being a
8 pioneering architectural form for the Village. Chairman Coladarci then identified specific examples from the
9 materials.

10
11 The Commission Members discussed the fact that the proposed demolition will have a significant negative
12 architectural or historical impact on either the Village as a whole or on the immediate neighborhood due to the
13 following architecturally or historically significant aspects of the structure: (i) the structure is a prominent example
14 of an early 20th century Mission Revival home with elements of Arts and Crafts style architecture that has retained
15 integrity to the exterior façade and internal historical architectural elements including tiles, ironwork, stained glass
16 windows, and elevator; (ii) the structure is a rare and prominent example of a Mission Revival style house for the
17 Sheridan Road Corridor, the Village of Winnetka, and the Chicago region; (iii) structure was home to several
18 prominent Winnetka residents including W. Clement Stone and Jessie Verna Stone, Albert and Gertrude Pick, and
19 James and Emily McMillan; and (iv) the house is a notable structure that would have met the criteria for local
20 landmark designation or listing on the National Register of Historic Places, if one of the previous owners had
21 sought such designations. The Commission Members also stated for the record the following suggested
22 alternatives for demolition including: (i) renovation of the existing house; (ii) sale to another owner that is
23 interested in preserving it; (iii) preserving the front façade of the existing home for a new home construction; and
24 (iv) relocating the existing house to a different property.

25
26 Ms. Good stated that the Commission may wish to mention the prior owner's affiliation with Abraham Lincoln.

27
28 Mr. Kotte referred to the Commission's discussion regarding the interior items' significance and identified the
29 items which can be salvaged. The Commission Members discussed at length the specific standards and references
30 to be included in the motion as well as options regarding preservation. Ms. Good referred to their prior discussion
31 of approaching homeowners and offering to purchase significant homes from them. Mr. Kotte reiterated he would
32 not consider other options. Mr. Enck suggested the possibility of building relocation.

33
34 Chairman Coladarci then asked for a motion that based upon the findings, which were previously stated,
35 demolition must be delayed for a period up to 270 days from February 5, 2024, to explore alternatives to
36 demolition and that demolition may not occur prior to November 1, 2024. A motion was made by Mr. Weaver and
37 seconded by Ms. Good. A vote was taken, and the motion unanimously passed, 5 to 0:

38
39 AYES: Coladarci, Enck, Good, Stuart, Weaver

40 NAYS: None

41 NON-VOTING: Handler, Zaranski

42
43 **Other Business:**

44 a. July 1, 2024 - Quorum Check.

45 The Commission Members discussed their availability. Mr. Marx informed the Commission he would attempt to
46 find an alternative special meeting date in July for the two demolition permit applications.

47
48 Chairman Coladarci asked if there was any new business. Ms. Good informed the Commission she would resign at
49 the end of tonight's meeting and explained her reasoning to the Commission and disappointment at not being able
50 to save 445 Sheridan Road from being demolished. Mr. Zaranski also provided comments regarding the loss of the
51 home. Chairman Coladarci praised Ms. Good for her service to the Commission.

Chairman Coladarci then asked for a motion to recognize Ms. Good's contributions to the Commission during her tenure since 2006. A motion as stated by Chairman Coladarci was made by Mr. Stuart and seconded by Mr. Enck. A vote was taken, and the motion passed, 4 to 1:

AYES: Coladarci, Enck, Stuart, Weaver

NAYS: Good

NON-VOTING: Handler, Zaranski

Adjournment:

Chairman Coladarci asked for a motion to adjourn. A motion to adjourn was made by Mr. Weaver and seconded by Mr. Enck. A vote was taken, and the motion unanimously passed, 5 to 0:

AYES: Coladarci, Enck, Good, Stuart, Weaver

NAYS: None

NON-VOTING: Handler, Zaranski

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Antionette Johnson

Recording Secretary